

FM REVIEW 2013 41 COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: The reviewers really liked this piece. It is not exactly revelatory for our readership, but I think as family medicine educators, they enjoy hearing the perspectives of their learners, especially those who ultimately choose family practice as their specialty. I recommend acceptance after the author attends to the very pertinent suggestions of the reviewers.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: Dear Ms., you tell an engaging story in a way that will interest readers and make them want to know the outcome. You are a strong writer. Please pay attention to the reviewers' comments, all of which will strengthen your essay. In particular:

- 1) The title is not well-suited to the main point of the article (how you came to choose FM). Although you echo it cleverly toward the end of the paper, it does not indicate what the essay is about. Please come up with a title that conveys something about why you ultimately decided on family medicine.
- 2) I agree with both reviewers who felt the final paragraph could be strengthened. I also felt you drew an unnuanced conclusion in saying that you could "never" be a specialist. Instead, restate how this patient catalyzed your choice, and perhaps highlight what you believed you would find in family medicine that does not exist (or is less emphasized) in other specialties. As reviewer 2 suggests, you could speculate about how a different specialty might approach the same patient.
- 3) The reference to alma mater is rather confusing. Maybe rephrase along these lines. "Fulfilling the motto of my medical school, I was able to..."

This is a lovely piece that will remind our readership of family medicine educators why they work hard every day to inspire students toward the specialty they love.

COMMENTS TO EDITOR II: The author has done a thorough job of addressing the minor revisions suggested. The essay now tells a valuable story about the kinds of patient care experiences that draw students to choose family medicine as their specialty. I recommend we accept this essay.

There are a couple of tiny changes that I'd recommend for the last paragraph.

- 1) In the final paragraph, the sentence (lines 36-37) that now reads ""Because there was no area of medicine that I could consider to be outside my purview..." I'd suggest changing to "Because there was no area of medicine that I could regard as being outside my purview, I considered the problem from every angle."
- 2) In the last line of the final paragraph, I believe "Alma Mater" should not be capitalized. I don't know whether we can make these minor stylistic changes, or whether they require authorial approval.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR II: Thank you for your revisions. The title reads much better, and more clearly reflects the content of the essay. You tell a worthwhile story about the kinds of clinical experiences that lead medical students to the specialty of family medicine.